

THE PRAGMATICS OF DEFINING RELIGION

Contexts, Concepts and Contests

EDITED BY

JAN G. PLATVOET

AND

ARIE L. MOLENDIJK



BRILL
LEIDEN · BOSTON · KÖLN
1999

CONTENTS

Preface	ix
Notes on the contributors	xi

PART ONE INTRODUCTION

ARIE L. MOLENDIJK In defence of pragmatism	3
---	---

PART TWO MODERN CONTEXTS

JAMES A. BECKFORD The politics of defining religion in secular society: From a taken-for-granted institution to a contested resource	23
MASSIMO INTROVIGNE Religion as claim: Social and legal controversies	41
DANIÈLE HERVIEU-LÉGER Religion as memory: Reference to tradition and the constitution of a heritage of belief in modern societies	73
JACOB A. BELZEN Paradoxes: An essay on the object of the Psychology of Religion	93

PART THREE CONCEPTUAL CHANGES

ERNST FEIL 'Religio' and 'religion' in the 18th century: The contrasting views of Wolff and Edelmann	125
ARIE L. MOLENDIJK Shifting cargoes: Ernst Troeltsch on the study of religion	149
WOUTER W. BELIER The sacred in the social sciences: On the definition of religion by the <i>Année sociologique</i> group	173

DAVID M. WULFF Psychologists define religion: Patterns and prospects of a century-long quest	207
--	-----

PART FOUR
METHODOLOGICAL ISSUES

HENDRIK JOHAN ADRIAANSE On defining religion	227
JAN G. PLATVOET To define or not to define: The problem of the definition of religion	245
JAMES L. COX Intuiting religion: A case for preliminary definitions	267
ANDRÉ F. DROOGERS The third bank of the river: Play, methodological ludism and the definition of religion	285
JAN A.M. SNOEK Defining 'religions' as the domain of study of the empirical sciences of religions	313

PART FIVE
DEFINITION PROPOSALS

WOUTER J. HANEGRAAFF Defining religion in spite of history	337
PETER BYRNE The definition of religion: Squaring the circle	379
MEERTEN B. TER BORG What is religion?	397
JEPPE SINDING JENSEN On a semantic definition of religion	409
HETTY ZOCK Religion as the realization of faith: The conceptualization of religion in relational psychoanalysis	433

PART SIX
EPILOGUE

JAN G. PLATVOET

Contexts, concepts & contests: Towards a pragmatics of defining 'religion'	463
Index of names	517
Index of subjects	522

PREFACE

The problem of the definition of religion is studied in this volume from many angles and by different disciplines. Apart from papers on the history of the concept of religion, methodological reflections on its definition are presented, as well as explicit definition proposals and their relation to research programmes. In addition, the volume contains analyses of the pragmatics and polemics of defining religion in modern societies, in both academic and extra-academic contexts. In the courts, for instance, the question is debated which groups may, or may not, count as 'a religion' and claim tax exemptions. Some of the contributions to this volume address such legal and political controversies. The focus of this collection is, however, on the pragmatic instrumentality and strategic intent of whatever concept of 'religion' is being proposed. We argue in favour of an anti-essentialist, anti-hegemonic and multi-dimensional approach, for religions are immensely varied and complex phenomena, which need to be studied by several academic disciplines from many different perspectives. A broad variety of definitions of religion may, therefore, be legitimately developed and proposed.

This collective volume stems from a working group in the Leiden Institute for the Study of Religions (LISOR), in which scholars working in the fields of the Psychology, Sociology, Philosophy, and Anthropology of Religion, and the Science (or History) of Religions co-operated. Other scholars, representing these various disciplines as well as a large range of approaches, were invited to contribute to this research project too. The Leiden participants intensively discussed the drafts of the contributions on many occasions. That, we hope, improved the quality of the final articles.

We thank all the contributors for joining this 'conference on paper', as it was once called, and the great efforts they spent in writing these chapters. We are especially grateful to Danièle Hervieu-Léger and Ernst Feil, who both—although it was agreed that they would write in their mother tongues—delivered their final contributions in English. The papers by non-native speakers were checked by Mrs. Sylvia Dierks-Mallett, and Dominique de Boer assisted in the