THE PRAGMATICS OF DEFINING RELIGION

Contexts, Concepts and Contests

EDITED BY

JAN G. PLATVOET

AND

ARIE L. MOLENDIJK

BRILL
LEIDEN · BOSTON · KÖLN
1999
CONTENTS

Preface ................................................................................................................. ix
Notes on the contributors ................................................................................ xi

PART ONE
INTRODUCTION

Arie L. Molendijk
In defence of pragmatism .............................................................................. 3

PART TWO
MODERN CONTEXTS

James A. Beckford
The politics of defining religion in secular society: From a
taken-for-granted institution to a contested resource ......................... 23
Massimo Introvigne
Religion as claim: Social and legal controversies ................................. 41
Daniele Hervieu-Léger
Religion as memory: Reference to tradition and the
constitution of a heritage of belief in modern societies .............. 73
Jacob A. Belzen
Paradoxes: An essay on the object of the Psychology
of Religion .................................................................................................. 93

PART THREE
CONCEPTUAL CHANGES

Ernst Feil
‘Religio’ and ‘religion’ in the 18th century:
The contrasting views of Wolff and Edelmann ......................... 125
Arie L. Molendijk
Shifting cargoes: Ernst Troeltsch on the study of religion ..... 149
Wouter W. Belier
The sacred in the social sciences: On the definition of
religion by the Année sociologique group ........................................... 173
Psychologists define religion: Patterns and prospects of a century-long quest ................................. 207

PART FOUR
METHODOLOGICAL ISSUES

HENDRIK JOHAN ADRIAANSE
On defining religion .................................................. 227

JAN G. PLAIVOET
To define or not to define: The problem of the definition of religion .................................................. 245

JAMES L. COX
Intuiting religion: A case for preliminary definitions .......... 267

ANDRÉ F. DROOGERS
The third bank of the river: Play, methodological ludism and the definition of religion .......................... 285

JAN A.M. SNOEK
Defining ‘religions’ as the domain of study of the empirical sciences of religions ............................... 313

PART FIVE
DEFINITION PROPOSALS

WOUTER J. HANEGRAAFF
Defining religion in spite of history ................................ 337

PETER BYRNE
The definition of religion: Squaring the circle ................. 379

MEERTEN B. TER BORG
What is religion? ...................................................... 397

JEPPE SINDING JENSEN
On a semantic definition of religion ................................ 409

HETTY ZOCK
Religion as the realization of faith: The conceptualization of religion in relational psychoanalysis ........... 433
CONTENTS

PART SIX
EPILOGUE

JAN G. PLATVOET
Contexts, concepts & contests: Towards a pragmatics of defining ‘religion’ ................................................................. 463

Index of names ........................................................................... 517
Index of subjects ....................................................................... 522
The problem of the definition of religion is studied in this volume from many angles and by different disciplines. Apart from papers on the history of the concept of religion, methodological reflections on its definition are presented, as well as explicit definition proposals and their relation to research programmes. In addition, the volume contains analyses of the pragmatics and polemics of defining religion in modern societies, in both academic and extra-academic contexts. In the courts, for instance, the question is debated which groups may, or may not, count as ‘a religion’ and claim tax exemptions. Some of the contributions to this volume address such legal and political controversies. The focus of this collection is, however, on the pragmatic instrumentality and strategic intent of whatever concept of ‘religion’ is being proposed. We argue in favour of an anti-essentialist, anti-hegemonic and multi-dimensional approach, for religions are immensely varied and complex phenomena, which need to be studied by several academic disciplines from many different perspectives. A broad variety of definitions of religion may, therefore, be legitimately developed and proposed.

This collective volume stems from a working group in the Leiden Institute for the Study of Religions (LISOR), in which scholars working in the fields of the Psychology, Sociology, Philosophy, and Anthropology of Religion, and the Science (or History) of Religions co-operated. Other scholars, representing these various disciplines as well as a large range of approaches, were invited to contribute to this research project too. The Leiden participants intensively discussed the drafts of the contributions on many occasions. That, we hope, improved the quality of the final articles.

We thank all the contributors for joining this ‘conference on paper’, as it was once called, and the great efforts they spent in writing these chapters. We are especially grateful to Danièle Hervieu-Léger and Ernst Feil, who both—although it was agreed that they would write in their mother tongues—delivered their final contributions in English. The papers by non-native speakers were checked by Mrs. Sylvia Dierks-Mallett, and Dominique de Boer assisted in the